DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 317 080 FL 018 435

AUTHOR Berney, Tomi D.; Watson, Heriberto
TITLE Project Triunfe, 1987-88. OREA Report.
INSTITUTION New York City Board of Education, Brooklyn, NY. Office of Research, Evaluation, and Assessment.
PUB DATE Jun 89
NOTE 35p.; For related document, see ED 298 782.
PUB TYPE Reports - Evaluative/Feasibility (142)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Bilingual Education Programs; *Computer Science Education; Counseling Services; Curriculum Development; *English (Second Language); Extracurricular Activities; Federal Programs; French; Haitian Creole; High Schools; Instructional Materials; Job Placement; *Limited English Speaking; Material Development; Mathematics Instruction; *Native Language Instruction; Parent Participation; Program Descriptions; *Program Evaluation; Science Instruction; Secondary Education; Second Language Programs; Social Studies; Spanish; Staff Development; Vocational Education
IDENTIFIERS Content Area Teaching; *Project Triunfe NY

ABSTRACT

In its fifth year of funding, Project TRIUNFE served 413 limited-English-proficient speakers of Spanish, French/Haitian Creole, Asian languages, and Polish at John Jay High School in Brooklyn. The program's aim was to supplement the high school's transitional bilingual education program, emphasizing computer instruction, partial English immersion, vocational training, job placement, and counseling. The program provided English-as-a-Second-Language (ESL) instruction to all students, native language arts to Hispanic and Haitian students, and bilingual content area instruction to Hispanic students. It also offered computer literacy and computer-assisted instruction in ESL, Spanish and French native language arts (NLA), and content areas. Staff development and parent involvement activities were included in the program. Project TRIUNFE accomplished its stated objectives in non-instructional areas (attendance, staff development, parent involvement, and most areas of curriculum and materials development), ESL, most aspects of NLA instruction, and most content area classes. Recommendations for program improvement include three daily periods of instruction for beginning ESL students, computer upgrading, provision of more individualized and/or small group instruction, and continued attempts to increase parent participation. (MSE)

**********
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
**********

EVALUATION SECTION
John E. Schoener, Chief Administrator
June 1989

# EVALUATION SECTION REPORT

## PROJECT TRIUNFE

1987 - 88

Prepared by
The Bilingual Education Evaluation Unit
Tomi D. Berney, Unit Manager
Heriberto Watson, Evaluation Consultant

New York City Public Schools
Office of Research, Evaluation, and Assessment
Robert Tobias, Director

## NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

Robert F. Wagner, Jr.
President

Dr. Irene H. Impellizzeri
Vice President

Dr. Gwendolyn C. Baker
Amalia V. Betanzos
Dr. Stephen R. Franse
James F. Regan
Edward L. Sadowsky

Bernard Mecklowitz
Chancellor

Dr. Dolores M. Fernandez
Deputy Chancellor for Instruction and Development

Dr. Harvey Robins
Deputy Chancellor for Financial Affairs

Joseph J. Saccente
Chief Executive for Operations

Amy Linden
Chief Executive for School Facilities

---

It is the policy of the New York City Board of Education not to discriminate on the basis of race, color, creed, national origin, age, handicapping condition, sexual orientation, or sex in its educational programs, activities, and employment policies, as required by law. Any person who believes he or she has been discriminated against should contact his or her Local Equal Opportunity Coordinator. Inquiries regarding compliance with appropriate laws, including Title IX and Section 504, may also be directed to Mercedes A. Nesfield, Director, Office of Equal Opportunity, 110 Livingston Street, Room 601, Brooklyn, New York 11201; or to the Director, Office of Civil Rights, United States Department of Education, 26 Federal Plaza, Room 33-130, New York, New York 10278.

---

5/22/89

PROJECT TRIUNFE*
1987-88

SUMMARY

- Project TRIUNFE was fully implemented during the 1987-88 school year. Participating students received instruction in English as a Second Language (E.S.L.) and in Native Language Arts (N.L.A.), bilingual content area instruction, business and vocational education, counseling, and job placement services and were able to participate in extracurricular activities. The program also provided staff development and parental involvement activities.

- The program met its objectives in E.S.L., N.L.A. (except in Spanish in the spring), content area classes (except in mathematics in the spring), student attendance rate, staff development, and parental involvement activities. It partially achieved its goal in curriculum development.

Project TRIUNFE was an Elementary and Secondary Education Act (E.S.E.A.) Title VII- funded program of instructional and support services. In the fifth year of a funding cycle (the second year of a grant extension), the project served 413 Limited English Proficient (LEP) speakers of Spanish, French/Haitian Creole, Asian languages, and Polish at John Jay High School in Brooklyn. TRIUNFE's aim was to supplement John Jay's transitional bilingual education program, emphasizing computer instruction, rapid learning of English through partial immersion in the language, vocational training, counseling, and job placement. Title VII- funded and partially funded staff included a project director, a computer/curriculum specialist, a job developer, a family assistant, and an educational assistant.

The project provided E.S.L. instruction to all students, N.L.A. to Hispanic and Haitian students, and bilingual content area instruction to Hispanic students. TRIUNFE also offered computer literacy training, and computer-assisted instruction in E.S.L., N.L.A., and the content areas. Project personnel used the Language Assessment Battery (LAB) at the end of the spring semester to assess English language skills. Office of Research, Evaluation, and Assessment (OREA) personnel examined course passing rates, performance on the LAB, attendance data provided by the program, information obtained from interviews of program and school personnel, and observations of classes to evaluate the program.

---

*This summary is based on the final evaluation of "Project TRIUNFE 1987-88" prepared by the OREA Bilingual Education Evaluation Unit.

The noninstructional component consisted of vocational education, counseling, job placement, staff development, and activities to encourage parental involvement.

The program accomplished its noninstructional objectives: 1) the attendance rate of program students was significantly higher than that of mainstream students; 2) more than ten program staff enrolled in a teacher education course and more than seven staff members participated in professional workshops, etc. held outside the school; and 3) TRIUNFE held at least four parent meetings each semester, thereby partially meeting this objective. The program developed curriculum materials in Haitian Creole and Spanish in N.L.A., mathematics, general science, and social studies.

The E.S.L. objective stated that students would make statistically significant gains on the LAB. Students showed an average Normal Curve Equivalent (N.C.E.) gain of 3.3 on the LAB, which was significant; the program met the objective.

The N.L.A. objective was that 70 percent of participating students would pass their courses. Of the students enrolled in Spanish N.L.A. courses, 83 percent passed in the fall and 66 percent passed in the spring. The program therefore achieved its objective in the fall. Of the students enrolled in N.L.A. courses in French, all students passed in the fall and in the spring; for that group the program achieved the objective in both semesters.

The program met the content area course objective (65 percent of the students would pass their mathematics, science, and social studies courses) in all areas in both semesters, except mathematics in the spring.

The conclusions, based on the findings of this evaluation, lead to the following recommendations:

- Provide beginning-level E.S.L. students with three daily periods of instruction.
- If funds permit, upgrade the computers.
- Provide students with more individualized and/or small group instructions, possibly through peer tutoring.
- Continue to make attempts to increase the level of parental attendance.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

In addition to those listed on the title page, we would like to express our appreciation to Arthur Lopatin for editing the report, Marbella Barrera for analyzing data, Margaret Scorza for coordinating production, and Betty Morales for typing the final document.

TABLE OF CONTENTS


| | | PAGE |
|---|---|---|
| I. | INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| | Participating Students | 1 |
| | Delivery of Services | 2 |
| | Materials and Resources | 2 |
| | Staff | 4 |
| | Setting | 4 |
| | History of Program | 5 |
| | Report Format | 5 |
| II. | EVALUATION METHODOLOGY | 6 |
| | Evaluation Questions | 6 |
| | Process/Implementation | 6 |
| | Outcome | 6 |
| | Evaluation Procedures | 6 |
| | Sample | 6 |
| | Instruments | 7 |
| | Data Collection | 7 |
| | Data Analysis | 7 |
| | Limitations | 8 |
| III. | EVALUATION FINDINGS: IMPLEMENTATION | 9 |
| | Noninstructional Activities | 9 |
| | Student Enrollment, Placement, and Programming | 9 |
| | Mainstreaming | 10 |
| | Staff | 11 |
| | Staff Development | 12 |
| | Support Services | 13 |
| | Extracurricular Activities | 13 |
| | Curriculum Development | 14 |
| | Parental Involvement | 14 |
| | Instructional Activities | 14 |
| | English as a Second Language | 14 |
| | Native Language Arts | 15 |
| | Content Area Subjects | 16 |
| | Business and Vocational Subjects | 17 |
| IV. | EVALUATION FINDINGS: OUTCOMES | 18 |
| | Noninstructional Outcomes | 18 |
| | Attendance | 18 |
| | Curriculum Development | 18 |
| | Instructional Outcomes | 19 |
| | English as a Second Language | 19 |
| | Native Language Arts | 21 |
| | Content Area Subjects | 21 |

V. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ..... 24

LIST OF TABLES

PAGE

TABLE 1: Number of Program Students by Age and Grade ..... 3

TABLE 2: N.C.E. Scores on the Language Assessment Battery.. 20

TABLE 3: Student Achievement in Native Language Arts ..... 23

TABLE 4: Student Achievement in Content Area Courses ..... 23

# I. INTRODUCTION

This report documents the Office of Research, Evaluation, and Assessment's (OREA's) evaluation of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act (E.S.E.A.) Title VII program, Project TRIUNFE, at John Jay High School. During the spring semester of the 1987-88 school year, the project completed its fifth year, the second year of a grant extension. This program was intended to provide instructional and support services to limited English proficient (LEP) students, supplementing John Jay's bilingual education program by providing computer-assisted instruction, computer literacy training, vocational education counseling and job placement, extracurricular activities, parental involvement activities, and staff development activities.

## PARTICIPATING STUDENTS

Project TRIUNFE's 413 students came from the Spanish-speaking countries of the Caribbean, and Central and South America (72 percent); Haiti (14 percent); the People's Republic of China and Hong Kong (six percent); and other countries of Europe, the Middle East, and Asia, as well as the United States (eight percent).

The majority of students who left the program during the fall semester transferred to other programs or schools; the majority of those who left during the spring were fully mainstreamed. Students participated in the program from one to three or more years. In grades nine through twelve, the majority of program students were in the eleventh grade; the

smallest number were in the ninth grade. (See Table 1.) Overall, 64 percent were overage for their grade placement.

Negative conditions affecting participating students included economic problems, which frequently necessitated working after school; marriage, pregnancy, and child rearing responsibilities; almost no exposure to English prior to entering the program; no literacy in their native language; and little or no education in their home country.

DELIVERY OF SERVICES

Students received instruction in English as a second language (E.S.L.), native language arts (N.L.A.) in Spanish and French/Haitian Creole, and bilingual content area classes (mathematics, science, and social studies). Project TRIUNFE provided support services which included tutoring, counseling, vocational training, career counseling, job placement, and extracurricular activities. The program emphasized computer instruction. Program personnel were involved in curriculum and staff development activities.

MATERIALS AND RESOURCES

TRIUNFE staff members developed and were using curriculum materials in word processing, N.L.A., and general biology. All materials, except those for N.L.A., paralleled mainstream curriculum materials.

TABLE 1

Number of Project Students by Age and Grade

| Age | Grade 9 | Grade 10 | Grade 11 | Grade 12 | Total |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 14 | 4 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 5 |
| 15 | 3 | 22 | 0 | 1 | 26 |
| 16 | 3 | 31 | 12 | 0 | 46 |
| 17 | 5 | 37 | 31 | 2 | 75 |
| 18 | 4 | 17 | 36 | 5 | 62 |
| 19 | 2 | 12 | 35 | 6 | 55 |
| 20 | 1 | 1 | 20 | 8 | 30 |
| 21 | 0 | 1 | 4 | 3 | 8 |
| TOTAL | 22 | 122 | 138 | 25 | 307* |

| Overage Students | Programwide | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Number | 15 | 68 | 95 | 17 | 195 |
| Percent | 68.2 | 55.7 | 68.8 | 68.0 | 63.5 |

Note. Shaded boxes indicate expected age range for grade.

*Data were missing for 106 students.

- Sixty-four percent of program students were overage for their grade.
- The lowest percentage of overage students was in the tenth grade.

STAFF

Since its inception, the program has been centralized under one project director whose position this year was 80 percent Title VII funded. There was a part-time (60 percent Title VII) computer/curriculum specialist, a part-time (20 percent Title VII) job developer, a full-time family assistant, and a full-time educational assistant.

The project director formerly served as TRIUNFE's computer/curriculum specialist. He had 16 years of educational experience, ten of them in the bilingual field, and was fluent in Spanish and English. The computer/curriculum specialist had three years of experience in bilingual education and spoke both Spanish and Italian. The job developer had 21 years of experience in education, including six years in E.S.L. and was fluent in both French and Spanish. The family assistant had 12 years of experience in education, of which four were in E.S.L., and was fluent in Spanish. Non-Title VII staff serving project students had from one to 21 years teaching experience.

SETTING

John Jay, located in Park Slope in Brooklyn, has experienced a declining enrollment. Its student body is limited almost exclusively to blacks and Hispanics from other neighborhoods.

The project office and the director's office, both located on the same floor, were lively places. Students used the project office for tutoring, counseling, doing their homework,

and working as aides. A showcase opposite the director's office displayed photographs of students, project staff members, and school administrators at various extracurricular events.

## HISTORY OF THE PROGRAM

Previous evaluation reports of Project TRIUNFE have presented the historical background of bilingual education at John Jay and a history of the earlier years of the program. See the 1986-87 report for a complete description.

## REPORT FORMAT

This report is organized as follows: Chapter II describes the evaluation methodology; Chapter III presents an analysis of the qualitative findings of the evaluation; and Chapter IV offers conclusions and recommendations based upon the results of the evaluation.

## II. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

### EVALUATION QUESTIONS

The evaluation assessed two major areas: program implementation and outcomes. Evaluation questions included the following:

Process/Implementation

- What were the responsibilities of project staff?
- How did program personnel select the course level into which to place students?
- What did the staff development include?
- What support services did the project offer the students?

Outcome

- Did students improve their English language skills, as measured by a test of English language proficiency?
- What percentage of program students passed their N.L.A. courses?
- What percentage of program students passed their courses in mathematics, science, and social studies?
- How did the attendance rate of program students compare with that of mainstream students?

### EVALUATION PROCEDURES

Sample

An OREA field consultant observed classes in E.S.L. and N.L.A., and a bilingual social studies course. He interviewed the program director, the school principal, and various members of the program and school staffs. OREA supplied the school with student data forms for the project population of 413 students;

the project returned data on 307 students, although not all the necessary data were provided on all forms.

Instruments

OREA developed an observation schedule to document the classroom environment, instructional activities, and materials. This office also developed a questionnaire for the project director, and interview schedules for the project director and other personnel. Project personnel used OREA-developed data retrieval forms to report student attendance and achievement data, while John Jay High School staff used the LAB to assess the acquisition of English-language skills and the level of ability in Spanish for those whose native language was Spanish, and teacher-made tests to assess progress in learning content area skills.

Data Collection

OREA staff interviewed school and program staff and observed classes during the spring of 1988. Project personnel completed the staff questionnaire and student data retrieval forms in the fall, and data retrieval forms again in the spring.

Data Analysis

OREA evaluated E.S.L. achievement by calculating the LAB pretest/posttest differences for the 100 students for whom the project provided such data. In lieu of a comparison group, OREA used N.C.E.s, which are equal interval scores based on the distribution of scores for the norming sample. Since the scores

are adjusted so that the norming sample mean of 50 does not change, an average gain of one N.C.E. is considered progress, and an average gain of seven N.C.E.s is considered exemplary. The office performed a t-test for the difference between means. OREA also looked at the passing rates for N.L.A. and content area courses, and evaluated attendance data by comparing attendance rates of program and mainstream students.

Limitations

Since all program-eligible students were involved either in the current project or another program for LEP students, it was impossible to select a similar comparison group. In addition, since English proficient students do not take pretests and posttests of the LAB, OREA could not use a gap-reduction design.

Project personnel did not provide data on all program participants. However, the numbers of students for whom there were data were large enough to make the analyses meaningful.

## III. EVALUATION FINDINGS: IMPLEMENTATION

Project TRIUNFE provided 413 LEP students with E.S.L. and N.L.A. classes, plus bilingual instruction in mathematics, science, social studies, and career education. The project's noninstructional component included tutoring, extracurricular activities, counseling, curriculum and staff development, and parental involvement.

### NONINSTRUCTIONAL ACTIVITIES

#### Student Enrollment, Placement, and Programming

Since the program's inception, it admitted students who scored below the twenty-first percentile on the English version of the Language Assessment Battery (LAB).* The project used the English LAB results to place students in E.S.L. classes. Spanish-speaking students received the Spanish version of the LAB in order to evaluate them for placement in a native language arts class.

Most school administrators and nonprogram instructional staff felt that Project TRIUNFE students were progressing in their bilingual or E.S.L. content area classes while they learned the English skills needed for mainstreaming.

---

*The Language Assessment Battery (LAB) was developed by the Board of Education of the City of New York to measure the English-language proficiency of nonnative speakers of English in order to determine whether their level of English proficiency was sufficient to enable them to participate effectively in classes taught in English. Students scoring below the twenty-first percentile on the LAB are entitled to bilingual and E.S.L. services.

Nevertheless, several staff members said that the growing number of students entering the program with deficiencies in native language and/or content area knowledge meant that additional efforts were needed to provide them with individualized and/or small-group instruction. On the whole, the school appeared to be very supportive of the program. It had added bilingual teachers to the staff and was commended by the principal.

Several program students received top honors; one was eligible to be school valedictorian. All graduates who applied to postsecondary schools were accepted, and 20 percent received special honors and scholarships. No program students were recommended for special education.

Mainstreaming

Students generally remained in the program for two years and were mainstreamed after completing their E.S.L. course sequence. The program's approach to mainstreaming was a planned, gradual transition in which students took more mainstream content area courses as their proficiency in English increased. According to program staff, the academic achievement of their mainstreamed students generally equaled or exceeded that of mainstream students, and their attendance rate was significantly higher.

Students who were fully mainstreamed in content area courses remained in bilingual homerooms and continued to be eligible for support services.

Staff

Besides administering the project and training teachers, the director provided career and personal counseling, job development and job placement services, and taught Spanish. When the assistant principal (A.P.) for foreign languages died in early 1988, the project director also assumed that position.

The computer/curriculum specialist organized and maintained the computer resource center, taught bilingual word processing classes, developed curricula in mathematics and E.S.L, and created computer programs to meet the individual instructional needs of program students.

The job developer determined what the job interests of bilingual students were, worked with the job counselor to find them jobs, helped students fill out employment applications, and assisted them in applying for social security cards and working papers. In addition, she taught French.

The family assistant had the responsibility of cultivating and maintaining contact with students' families through home visits and by phone, orienting new students, producing the project's newsletter, tutoring students, and performing clerical tasks. Because the family assistant was ill from September 1987 he was able to meet few of his responsibilities. The project requested a budget modification so that an extra family assistant could be hired for the spring. The educational assistant provided individualized instruction, particularly to

newly arrived students and to those with learning problems in E.S.L. classes.

Other staff members who served program students but were not funded by Title VII included E.S.L. and bilingual content area teachers. Of these, the school had recruited the mathematics and science teachers, and one of the N.L.A. teachers in Spain. Three teachers were from Puerto Rico, one was from Cuba, and one was from the Dominican Republic. In addition to their regular teaching duties, bilingual teachers of program students supervised a peer-tutoring program and coordinated a variety of extracurricular and parental involvement activities.

Staff Development

The program proposed the following implementation objectives in the area of staff development:

- Ten program staff members will enroll in at least one teacher education course per year.
- Seven program staff members will participate in professional workshops, conferences, or symposia held outside of school each year.
- Six meetings of program staff will be held at school each year.
- Title VII staff will meet as needed, usually weekly.

Twelve staff members attended university courses paid by Title VII funds. A total of 32 teachers attended three workshops held outside school. One staff member attended a conference in Washington, D.C. and the project director went to a conference in Albany, NY. Program staff met at the beginning, middle, and end of each semester; Title VII staff met regularly

as needed. Workshops, departmental meetings, classroom observations and the conferences that went along with them, and the mentor programs were some of the additional ways in which staff development occurred. Project TRIUNFE easily accomplished its staff development objectives.

Support Services

The project provided counseling through the bilingual counselor. It provided bilingual tutoring by bilingual teachers five days a week, as well as English-language subject area tutoring, job counseling, college and career counseling, and a full range of services provided by counselors and career advisers from ASPIRA.* Fully mainstreamed students were eligible to continue receiving these services.

Extracurricular Activities

TRIUNFE organized an International Food Festival and a number of trips for students and parents, including visits to the Intrepid Museum, the Museo del Barrio, City Hall, and Hunter College. Students attended shows of El Repertorio Español. Many TRIUNFE students participated actively in the school's chapter of ASPIRA. Bilingual students seemed to mingle easily with their mainstream peers in schoolwide extracurricular activities; the project appeared to be well integrated with the rest of the school.

---

*ASPIRA is a Hispanic educational and social service organization.

Curriculum Development

TRIUNFE had developed and was using curriculum materials in word processing, native language arts, and general biology. Materials were being developed in ten additional subjects. All materials except those for native language arts paralleled those used in mainstream courses.

Parental Involvement

- The program will hold at least four meetings of parents each semester, in which project staff and guest speakers will present information on issues of importance to parents.

The program held parent-teacher conferences every semester. There were also bimonthly Parents' Advisory Council (PAC) meetings, which dealt with such topics as graduation requirements, school policies, and school regulations. Classes, workshops, the P.T.A., and ASPIRA club meetings also involved parents. The project placed particular emphasis on "Atrevéte a Votar," a voter registration drive for Hispanics.

Although the program met its parental involvement objective, several staff members said that attendance levels at the various activities were disappointingly low.

INSTRUCTIONAL ACTIVITIES

English as a Second Language

John Jay offered three levels of E.S.L. (beginning, intermediate, and advanced) in both the fall and the spring. Each class was one period in length. Students also attended a corresponding one-credit English reading class. John Jay

planned to offer three periods of beginning E.S.L. in the fall of 1988, and to add two more E.S.L. courses.

Both E.S.L. and English reading courses used teacher-developed materials as well as textbooks. A committee of E.S.L. teachers, in consultation with the A.P., selected all curricular materials.

The only criticism of the E.S.L. component was that not enough individualized or small-group tutoring was available to the growing number of students who had little or no education in their home country.

An OREA field consultant observed a basic E.S.L. class of 14 students. The teacher read an English passage aloud and explained difficult words by using body language and drawings. He then wrote the words on the blackboard and asked questions designed to make sure the students had understood the passage. He used English exclusively, but some students made comments, gave the meanings of unknown words, or asked questions in Spanish.

Native Language Arts

In the fall and the spring, John Jay High School offered eight classes of beginning, intermediate, and advanced Spanish for native speakers. Included were two special courses in native history and culture: advanced Spanish, which dealt with South American culture, and Spanish II which dealt with the Spanish influence on South American culture.

The staff said that Spanish N.L.A. courses were sufficient to meet students' needs. The program did not report on the specific Haitian Creole N.L.A. courses.

Fifteen students attended a Spanish II class observed by a field consultant. The class reviewed vocabulary and punctuation, and discussed the words for parts of the face. The teacher began by asking the students to make singular sentences plural. A second student supplied the answer if the first student was unable to do so. The teacher then wrote the sentence on the blackboard and asked the class if there were any mistakes in agreement or punctuation. The teacher spent slightly more time teaching the entire class than she did reviewing exercises and working with individual students. Students paid attention and did the required work but were reluctant to ask questions or make comments.

Content Area Subjects

Fall bilingual course offerings for Spanish-speaking participants consisted of general science; biology; fundamental, consumer, and sequential mathematics; government; and American and global history. Spring offerings included general science; biology; American and global history; economics; and fundamental and sequential mathematics.

Program staff said that the amount of English used in the classroom varied with the students' proficiency; the average was approximately ten percent. English use tended to be limited to vocabulary. The bilingual content area curricula were virtually

identical to mainstream content area curricula. Every course was credit bearing. Bilingual course offerings were sufficient to meet students' needs.

An OREA consultant observed a tenth-grade social studies class on current events, taught exclusively in Spanish. The teacher wrote the topic on the blackboard and asked questions about the most significant event occurring in Moscow. Students answered almost all of the teacher's questions in an orderly and enthusiastic fashion. The teacher proceeded to translate a newspaper article on this topic into Spanish and questioned individual students. Twenty-nine students were present.

Business and Vocational Subjects

The program offered computer literacy, including word processing, to all students. This course was not available to mainstream students. Its functionality, however, was diminished because of the outmoded equipment used.

## IV. EVALUATION FINDINGS: OUTCOMES

### NONINSTRUCTIONAL OUTCOMES

#### Attendance

- As a result of participating in the program, students' attendance will be significantly higher than the attendance rate of mainstream students.

TRIUNFE students' attendance rate exceeded that of mainstream students by a significant margin. While the attendance rate for the school population was 73.5 percent, program students had a mean rate of 84.9 percent. The statistical significance was determined through the application of a $z$-test for the significance of a proportion.* This procedure tests whether the difference between one group's rate (in this case, the program's) and a standard rate (in this case, the school's) is greater than can be expected by chance variation. The $z$-test results ($z = 3.9$) were statistically significant ($p > .05$). The significant difference in attendance rates showed that the program achieved the objective.

#### Curriculum Development

- By the end of the project, the resource specialists will have developed curriculum materials in Haitian Creole and Spanish for each of the following areas: native language arts, mathematics, general science, and social studies.

TRIUNFE developed and was using curriculum materials in native language arts, general biology, and word processing.

---

*Bruning, J.L. and Kintz, B.L. Computational Handbook of Statistics (Glenview, IL: Scott, Foresman, and Company, 1968).

Materials development in ten additional subjects was underway. The project partially accomplished its objective.

INSTRUCTIONAL OUTCOMES

English as a Second Language

- E.S.L. students participating in the program will make statistically significant gains in English language proficiency.

The assessment instrument used to evaluate the proposed objective was the English language version of the LAB. To assess students' achievement in English, OREA computed a correlated t-test on students' normal curve equivalent (N.C.E.) scores on the pretest and posttest.* The t-test determines whether the difference between means is significantly greater than would be expected by chance variation alone. The effect size was calculated to show educational meaningfulness.** Complete LAB pretest and posttest scores were available for 100 students. (See Table 2.) Overall, students made statistically significant gains from pretest to posttest. The mean gains

---

*Raw scores were converted to N.C.E. scores, which are normalized standard scores. They have the advantage of forming an equal interval scale so that scores and gains can be averaged. For the norming population, N.C.E.s have a mean of 50, a standard deviation of approximately 20, and a range from one to 99. Scores can be compared to the norming population.

**The effect size, developed by Jacob Cohen, is a ratio of the mean gain to the standard deviation of the gain. This ratio provides an index of improvement in standard deviation units irrespective of the size of the sample. Effect size (E.S.) is interpreted to indicate educational meaningfulness, and an E.S. of .80 is thought to be highly meaningful, while one of .2 is considered to be only slightly so.

TABLE 2

N.C.E. Scores on the Language Assessment Battery

| Grade | Number of Students | Pretest Mean | Pretest S.D. | Posttest Mean | Posttest S.D. | Difference Mean | Difference S.D. | t-value | Effect Size |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 9 | 7 | 13.0 | 12.8 | 16.1 | 13.3 | 3.1 | 2.3 | 3.67* | 1.35 |
| 10 | 39 | 10.7 | 14.3 | 11.7 | 13.0 | 1.0 | 9.2 | .70 | .11 |
| 11 | 52 | 10.3 | 10.3 | 15.5 | 15.2 | 5.2 | 13.1 | 2.85* | .40 |
| 12 | 1 | 13.0 | -0- | 29.0 | -0- | 16.0 | -0- | 99.00 | ** |
| TOTAL | 100" | 10.8 | 12.1 | 14.1 | 14.1 | 3.3 | 11.5 | 2.89* | .29 |

*p > .05; posttest score was significantly greater than pretest.

**Effect size cannot be calculated.

"Total includes one student for whom grade level data were missing.

- Average N.C.E. scores showed a significant increase from pretest to posttest.
- N.C.E. gains indicated that Project TRIUNFE achieved its E.S.L. objective.

ranged from 1 to 16. Concomitant effect sizes ranged from very small to large indicating little to high educational significance. When examined by grade, however, only the gains of students in the ninth and eleventh grades were significant. The program reported the grade of only one twelfth-grade student, so although the pretest/posttest mean difference appeared to be great, there may be no statistical significance.

Inspection of students' passing rates in E.S.L. classes shows that, in the fall, 85 percent of 201 students (171 students) passed their E.S.L. courses, and 91 percent of 191 students (174) passed mainstream English classes. In the spring, 67 percent of 143 students (96) passed their E.S.L. courses, and 84 percent of 157 students (132) passed their mainstream English classes.

Native Language Arts

- Seventy percent of students participating in the program will score at or above the 65 percent passing criterion in native language arts instruction.

Data were available for 135 students enrolled in N.L.A. classes in the fall and for 112 students enrolled in the spring. (See Table 3.) In both semesters, over 70 percent of program students passed their N.L.A. courses, indicating that TRIUNFE achieved its N.L.A. objective.

Content Area Subjects

- Sixty-five percent of program participants will score at or above the 65 percent passing criterion in mathematics, science, and social studies.

Teachers used teacher-made tests to evaluate student achievement in content area subjects. Overall, in all three subject areas and in both semesters, except mathematics in the spring, students met this criterion. (See Table 4.)

TABLE 3

Student Achievement in Native Language Arts

| Language | Fall | | Spring | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | Number of Students | Percent Passing | Number of Students | Percent Passing |
| French | 14 | 100.0 | 12 | 100.0 |
| Spanish | 94 | 83.0 | 86 | 66.3 |
| Nonspecified | 27 | 81.5 | 14 | 71.4 |
| TOTAL | 135 | 84.4 | 112 | 70.5 |

- In both semesters, students met the program criterion that at least 65 percent would pass.
- A larger percentage of students passed Spanish N.L.A. courses in the fall semester than in the spring.

TABLE 4

Student Achievement in Content Area Courses

| Subject | Fall | | Spring | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | Number of Students | Percent Passing | Number of Students | Percent Passing |
| Mathematics | 169 | 67.5 | 133 | 60.7 |
| Science | 121 | 76.0 | 104 | 74.0 |
| Social Studies | 167 | 79.6 | 143 | 74.8 |

- Students met the program criterion that 70 percent would pass their N.L.A. courses, except in mathematics in the spring semester.

## V. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

In its fifth year of operation, Project TRIUNFE served 413 limited English proficient (LEP) speakers of Spanish, French/Haitian Creole, Asian languages, and Polish at John Jay High School in Brooklyn. TRIUNFE's aim was to supplement John Jay's transitional bilingual education program, emphasizing computer instruction, rapid learning of English through partial immersion in the language, vocational training, counseling, and job placement.

As in the previous year, Project TRIUNFE met all of its implementation objectives in staff development and parental involvement, as well as its outcome objectives in attendance, E.S.L., Spanish and French/Haitian Creole N.L.A., and the content areas (except mathematics in the spring semester). It partially met its curriculum development goal. Although beginning-level E.S.L. students did not receive the three periods of instruction they were entitled to, the school was planning to add the necessary classes in the fall. TRIUNFE also offered computer literacy training and computer-assisted instruction, although it did not propose any objectives in that area.

There was integration of project and mainstream students. Students who were fully mainstreamed flourished. It was apparent that Project TRIUNFE was a successful program and was effectively accomplishing what it set out to do.

The conclusions, based on the findings of this evaluation, lead to the following recommendations:

- Provide beginning-level E.S.L. students with three daily periods of instruction.
- If funds permit, upgrade the computers.
- Provide students with more individualized and/or small-group instruction, possibly through peer tutoring.
- Continue to make attempts to increase the level of parental attendance.